City of San Diego Historical Resources Board



Historical Resource Research Report Guidelines and Requirements

Land Development Manual Historical Resources Guidelines Appendix E, Part 1

Adopted by the Historical Resources Board November 30, 2006



Preparing a Historical Resource Research Report



The purpose of this document is to provide clear direction and a standardized format for all historical research reports prepared for the City of San Diego. A clear understanding of required information, documentation, and formatting will reduce the number of reports sent back for supplemental information and will allow both City staff and members of the Historical Resources Board (HRB) to more efficiently and effectively review resources being considered for historic designation. Therefore, beginning January 1, 2007, all historical resource research reports prepared for the City of San Diego must provide information, documentation and formatting as follows. The only exception to this requirement is in the case of a nomination for designation of an important archaeology site when an Archaeological Resource Management Report has already been completed consistent with the Historical Resources Guidelines found in Appendix C of the Land Development Manual.

It should be noted that if staff determines during review of the report that required documentation, information, and analysis has not been provided or addressed as outlined in this document, the report may be sent back and the applicant will be required to resubmit the report.

Once the historical resource research report is deemed complete by staff, the applicant must submit a copy of the report to the South Coast Information Center (their contact information can be found the "Research Resource" section of this document).

"At-a-Glance" Report Summary

- Use the "At-a-Glance" Report Summary sheets included in this document as the title sheet and table of contents sheet of the Historical Resource Research Report.
 - o The "Site Information and Applicable Criteria" Report Summary shall be filled out by the applicant and will serve as the title sheet.
 - o The "Required Forms and Documentation" sheet shall also be filled out by the applicant and will serve as the table of contents.
- Historical Resource Research Reports which do not provide the two "At-a-Glance" Report Summary sheets will not be accepted.
- The applicant may provide their own individualized cover sheet in front of these two forms if they choose to do so.

Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) 523 forms

All information and discussion of historicity and significance must be fully contained within Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) 523 forms. These forms are available on-line by visiting the California State Office of Historic Preservation website at http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/?page_id=1069. Historical reports that do not provide DPR forms, or provide them as attachments, will no longer be accepted. (Please refer to the attached DPR examples for clarification of HRB requirements and formatting.)

- Complete all DPR forms that are appropriate for the resource type. These include, but are not limited to:
 - o 523-A Primary Record (for all resource types)
 - o 523-B Building Structure and Object Record (for all buildings, structures, and objects)
 - o 523-C Archaeological Site Record Form (for archaeological sites only)
 - o 523-D District Record Form (for proposed districts only)
 - o 523-L Continuation Sheet (for information which cannot be contained within forms A-D)
- The analysis contained within the DPR forms must include:
 - Section P3a: A full architectural description of the building from the top down. Begin by identifying the style, date of construction and size of the building. Then describe the appearance of the building, including form, building materials, fenestration, architectural details, and condition of the building, as well as the setting, and the boundaries. If the property under evaluation is a commercial building, an analysis of publicly accessible interiors (such as lobbies, theatres, etc) must be included. (Refer to the Technical Assistance section for further information.)
 - Section B6: A complete analysis and accounting of any and all alterations or modifications to the building, including re-roofing, re-stuccoing, replacement of siding, replacement of windows, additions, removals, etc. In addition to a field inspection, all available building records, including the residential building record, any and all building permit records, and all available Notices of Completion should be used in this analysis. Current owners should always be interviewed for information regarding modifications/maintenance of the property, and whenever possible, prior owners should be interviewed as well. Current and prior owners may also be a resource for historic photographs of the building which document changes, if any.
 - In addition, all modifications to original historic fabric must be identified and analyzed for its impact to the integrity of the structure.
 - If more space is required, use a DPR 523(L) form, also known as a Continuation Sheet. Use as many Continuation Sheets as necessary.
 - O Section B10: An analysis of the property under all established Historical Resources Board Criteria under criterion headings. The applicant should make a clear and compelling argument as to why the property is or is not significant and eligible for designation under each criterion. (Please refer to the "Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Criteria for Designation" for assistance in applying the criteria). If more space is required, use a DPR 523(L) form, also known as a Continuation Sheet. Use as many Continuation Sheets as necessary. It should be noted that analysis under State and National Criteria is not required unless the applicant is pursuing designation under HRB Criterion E or unless the report is being prepared in response to a request from the Development Services Department.

- The integrity of the resource should be included in the discussion of the property's eligibility under HRB criteria. The resource must retain integrity in order to be eligible for designation under any and all HRB criteria. The discussion of integrity should be tied to the property type and its contributing character defining features. Not all aspects of integrity are equally significant for all properties. For example, the integrity aspects of setting and location may not be as important for properties significant under HRB Criteria C and D, whereas setting and location can be highly important for properties significant under HRB Criteria A and B. Design materials and workmanship can be more important under HRB Criteria C and D than under HRB Criteria A and B. Feeling and association can be important under all HRB Criteria. Mathematical calculations for integrity analysis are not acceptable.
- If the applicant is proposing designation under HRB Criterion B for "significant person", discuss how the property comparatively relates to other properties that the individual may have owned and/or occupied. Also include a discussion of the important person's achievements and the dates of the achievements (period of significance) and demonstrate that they occupied the property during the identified period of significance.
- If the applicant is proposing designation under HRB Criterion D for association with a "Master", discuss how the property is representative of their body of work. If the individual is not already recognized as a Master, provide enough evidence through an analytical narrative and supporting documentation in the attachments to show the breadth of the individual's body of work; the high quality of their craftsmanship and/or whether peers considered them to be a Master; as well as how the property in question fits into the overall body of work and how it is representative of that body of work.

Attachments

- All supporting documentation must be provided within standardized attachments, and shall no longer be permitted within the body of the report. In addition, all supporting documentation listed below must be provided, and the attachment pages included in this document must be used at the beginning of each attachment (A-G). If the documentation cannot be found, a sheet must be inserted in its place stating that the information was not available. Supporting documentation shall be provided as follows:
 - o Attachment A: Building Development Information
 - County Assessor's Building Record
 - Notice of Completion
 - Water/Sewer Connection Records
 - Construction Permits (electrical, mechanical & plumbing permits not required)
 - Previous Historical Resource Survey Forms

- o Attachment B: Ownership and Occupant Information
 - Chain of Title (in tabular format)
 - City Directory Listing of Occupants (in tabular format)
 - Copy of the Deed from the date of construction
- o Attachment C: Maps
 - City of San Diego 800 Scale Engineering Maps (with north arrow and site location)
 - USGS Map (with north arrow and site location identified)
 - Current USGS Map
 - Historical USGS Maps
 - Original Subdivision Map (with site location)
 - Sanborn Maps (if the area that the property is located in was not shown on a given year, then insert a sheet in its place stating that a map was not available)
 - 1886/1887
 - 1906
 - 1921
 - 1940
 - 1950
 - 1956
- Attachment D: Photographs
 - Historical (including transitional photos)
 - Current
 - North (wide shot and details in color)
 - East (wide shot and details in color)
 - South (wide shot and details in color)
 - West (wide shot and details in color)
- O Attachment E: HRB Criteria, Supplemental Documentation (Provide any primary or secondary documentation relevant to designation under the applicable HRB designation criteria. This may include obituaries, biographies, newspaper articles, advertisements, subdivision maps, photographs, scholarly journal articles, etc). In addition, the following supplemental information <u>must</u> be provided:

 Criterion A: No required supplemental documentation. To be provided at the applicant's discretion.

Criterion B:

- For "significant person" designations, provide a tabular listing of all other San Diego addresses for the person, indicating whether the buildings are still extant and describing their integrity (excellent, good, fair, poor, demolished).
- Criterion C: No required supplemental documentation. To be provided at the applicant's discretion.

Criterion D:

- Provide a listing of all known properties currently designated for an association with the Master.
- If the individual is not already recognized as a Master, provide supporting documentation to show the breadth of the individual's body of work; the high quality of their craftsmanship and/or whether peers considered them to be a Master; as well as how the property in question fits into the overall body of work and how it is representative of that body of work. This may include current photos of cited works and a map of their locations.

Criterion E:

 Provide a copy of the State or National listing or Determination of Eligibility.

Criterion F:

- Provide a copy of the Historical District's Boundary, Context Statement, and Period of Significance.
- o Attachment F: Works Cited (bibliography)
- o Attachment G: CEQA Determination (Include only if required by the Development Services Department for discretionary reviews.)
 - Provide information regarding the consultant's professional qualifications and whether or not he or she meets the City's Professional Qualification requirements (found in the Historical Resources Guidelines in the San Diego Land Development Manual).
 - If the report is being prepared in a response to a Development Service's request for a Site Specific Historical Report, please provide an analysis of the property's historical significance under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).
 - An South Coast Information Center (SCIC) records search should be included as part of the CEQA analysis.

Technical Assistance



In order to assist the applicant in preparing a complete historical resource report for consideration by the Historical Resources Board, HRB staff has compiled the following list of documents and resources designed to guide the applicant through the analysis of a resource and the preparation of a historical resource research report.

The following resources are available to provide assistance preparing a historical resource research report:

To view the City of San Diego's Historical Resources Guidelines in the Land Development Manual, please visit http://www.sandiego.gov/development-services/industry/pdf/landdevmanual/ldmhistorical.pdf

For assistance in completing a DPR 523 form please review "Instructions for Recording Historical Resources", by going to http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/pages/1054/files/manual95.pdf . Assistance with completing a DPR form consistent with the City's requirements can also be found at the end of this document.

For assistance with evaluating the architecture and character defining features of a building, please review *National Park Service Brief 17*: "Architectural Character Identifying the Visual Aspects of Historic Buildings as an Aid to Preserving Their Character" by going to http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief17.htm

For assistance with assessing the integrity of a resource, please review *National register Bulletin 15*: "How to Evaluate the Integrity of a Property" by going to http://www.cr.nps.gov/nr/publications/bulletins/nrb15/nrb15_8.htm

For assistance evaluating a property within a historical context, please review *National Register Bulletin 15*: "How to Evaluate a Property within its Historic Context" by going to http://www.cr.nps.gov/nr/publications/bulletins/nrb15/nrb15_5.htm

For assistance applying the City of San Diego Historical Resources Board's designation criteria, please review the "Guidelines for the Application of HRB Criteria" by going to http://www.sandiego.gov/planning/programs/historical/index.shtml

For assistance evaluating a property's historical significance under CEQA, please review "California Office of Historic Preservation Technical Assistance Series #1: California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Historical Resources" by going to http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/pages/1054/files/ts01ca.pdf

*It should be noted that the popular reference book *A Field Guide to American Houses* by Virginia and Lee McAlester can be a useful starting point for the identification of architectural styles, but is not a definitive guide and has limited use and applicability within San Diego, which has many vernacular and hybrid variations of architecture.

Research Resources



In order to assist the applicant in preparing a complete historical resource report for consideration by the Historical Resources Board, HRB staff has compiled the following list of agencies, archives, and repositories where required documentation can be found. This list is not comprehensive, but provides a starting point for research.

WHERE TO GO:

San Diego County Assessor/Recorders Office 1600 Pacific Highway, Room 103 San Diego, CA 92101

(619) 236-3771

City of San Diego Water Operations, Maps & Records 2797 Caminito Chollas San Diego, CA 92105 (619) 527-7482

San Diego Historical Society Casa de Balboa, lower level 1649 El Prado, Balboa Park (619) 232-6203

South Coast Information Center 4283 El Cajon Blvd. St. 250 San Diego, CA 92105 Phone: 619.594.5682 (call for appointment)

San Diego Public Library Central Library, California Room 820 E Street San Diego, CA 92101-6478 (619) 236-5800

City of San Diego Development Services Dept 1222 First Avenue, 2nd Floor, Records Section San Diego CA 92101 (619) 446-5200

City of San Diego Planning Department 202 C Street, 4th Floor San Diego CA 92101 (619) 235-5224 (call for appointment)

Various University Libraries

WHAT YOU'LL FIND:

Residential Building Record Notice of Completion Deed Information (Chain of Title)

Water and Sewer Connection Records

Historical Photographs Biographical Information Historical Maps

Previous Surveys/Records of the Property
Previous Surveys/Records of Surrounding Properties

San Diego City Directories Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps Historical Newspapers & Clippings Rare Books

Building/Construction Permit Records

Inventory Forms from Previous Surveys Historical Site Designation Files Info on established Masters

Newspaper Articles & Images Magazines Scholarly Research Special Collections

"At-a-Glance" Report Summary Property Information & Applicable Criteria



Resource Type:			
	y):		
Resource Address:			
APN:	Requesting Mills Act? Y □ N □		
Date of Construction:	Architect/Builder:		
Prior Resource Address (if relocated):			
Date of Relocation:			
Applicant's Name:	Owner's Name:		
Address:	Address:		
	Phone #:		
Email:	Email:		
☐ HRB Criterion A as a special element ☐ historical development ☐ archae ☐ social development ☐ economic ☐ engineering development ☐ land	esignation as a historical resource under: of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's eological development		
☐ HRB Criterion B for its association will local, state or national history for the following	who/which is significant in owing reason(s):		
☐ HRB Criterion C as a good/excellent e	example of		
☐ HRB Criterion D as a notable work of ☐ Previously established as a Ma			
listing on the National Register of Histor	has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for ic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the sting on the State Register of Historical Resources.		
☐ HRB Criterion F as a contributing reso	ource to the Historical District		

"At-a-Glance" Report Summary | Required Forms and Documentation



Circle Yes or No, indicating whether or not the following required documentation has been provided:

Report Copies

Y N Provide one copy of the Historical Resource Research Report, stapled at the corner

Department of Parks and Recreation Forms

- Primary Record (523a) Y N
- Y N BSO Record (523b)
- Y N Archaeological Record (523c) (if applicable)
- District Record (523d) (if applicable) Y N
- Y N Locational Map (523j) (if applicable)
- Y Sketch Map (523k) (if applicable) N
- Y N Continuation Sheet (5231)

Attachment A

Attachment B

Y	N	Assessor's Record	Y	N	Chain of Title
Y	N	Notice of Completion	Y	N	Directory Search
Y	N	Water Sewer Records	Y	N	Deed from the Date of Construction
Y	N	Building Permits			
Y	N	Previous Survey Forms			

Attachment C

Attachment E

N

N

Y

Y

Attachment D

Y	N	City SD 800 Scale Eng Maps	Y	N	Historical and Transitional Photos
Y	N	USGS Maps	Y	N	Current Photos of North Elevation
Y	N	Original Subdivision Map	Y	N	Current Photos of East Elevation
Y	N	1886/1887 Sanborn	Y	N	Current Photos of South Elevation
Y	N	1906 Sanborn	Y	N	Current Photos of West Elevation
T 7	N.T	1001 0 1			

- 1921 Sanborn Y N
- Y N 1940 Sanborn
- Y N 1950 Sanborn
- Y N 1956 Sanborn

Attachment F

N

Y

Works Cited Y N

- Y N Criterion B Documentation
- Y

Criterion A Documentation

Criterion D Documentation

Criterion C Documentation N Attachment G

- **Professional Qualifications**
- Criterion E Documentation Y N Y N **CEQA** Evaluation
- Y N Criterion F Documentation Y N SCIC Records Search

Attachment A Building Development Information

A.1 – Assessor's Building Record

A.2 – Notice of Completion

A.3 - Water/Sewer Records

A.4 – Building/Construction Permits

A.5 – Previous Survey Forms

Attachment B

Ownership and Occupant Information

B.1 - Chain of Title

B.2 - Directory Search of Occupants

B.3 – Deed from the Date of Construction

Attachment C Maps

```
C.1 – City of San Diego 800 Scale
Engineering Map
C.2 – Current and Historical USGS Maps
C.3 – Original Subdivision Map
C.4 – Sanborn Maps
1886/1887
1906
1921
1940
1950
1956
```

Attachment D Photographs

D.1 – Historical Photographs

D.2 – Current Photographs

Attachment E HRB Criteria Supplemental Documentation

E.1 – Criterion A

E.2 - Criterion B

E.3 - Criterion C

E.4 - Criterion D

E.5 - Criterion E

E.6 - Criterion F

Attachment F Works Cited

F.1 – Provide a list of works cited (bibliography)

Attachment G Evaluation Under CEQA

(If the Report is Response to a Request from the Development Services Department)

- G.1 Statement of Professional Qualifications
- G.2 Evaluation Consistent with Development Services Requirements
- G.3 SCIC Records Search

DPR 523 Form Examples



The following three pages provide copies of the three most commonly used Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) 523 forms. All sections identified on the form in bold print with an asterisk must be completed. Staff has provided comments highlighted to assist the applicant with the preparation of these forms as required by the Historical Resources Board.

State of California — The Resou DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND		Primary # HRI #	
PRIMARY RECORD		Trinomial	
	Other Listings	NRHP Status Code	Data
Page of	Review Code *Resource Name or #:	Reviewer	Date
P1. Other Identifier: *P2. Location: □ Not for Publica and (P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach *b. USGS 7.5' Quad: c. Address:	a Location Map as necessary.) Date: mE/ mN (G.P.S.)	City:	% of % of Sec ; M.D. B.I Zip: e) Elevation:
		-	n, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)
details, and condition of the build building, an analysis of publicly a	ing, as well as the setting, an ccessible interiors (such as lottifying the Visual Aspects of	nd the boundaries. If the pro obbies, theatres, etc) must be Historic Buildings as an Ai	ng materials, fenestration, architectural perty under evaluation is a commercia e included. For assistance, please refer t d to Preserving Their Character", whic
Descriptions relative to Archaeolo manner consistent with National l			Properties should be completed in a nformation and assistance:
National Register Bulletin 38; *P3b. Resource Attributes: (List a *P4. Resources Present: □B P5a. Photo or Drawing (Photo re	attributes and codes) Building □Structure □Obj	ect □Site □District □E	lement of District □Other (Isolates, etc □ P5b. Description of Photo: (View date, accession #)
Provide a CURRENT photo of the p	orimary (public) elevation.		*P6. Date Constructed/Age an Sources: □Historic □Both
			*P7. Owner and Address:
			*P8. Recorded by: (Name, affiliation, and address)
			*P9. Date Recorded: *P10. Survey Type: (Describe)
report and other sources, or enter "non-	e.")		*P11. Report Citation: (Cite sur
□Archaeological Record □[District Record □Linear		Building, Structure, and Object Rec g Station Record □Rock Art Rec
□ Artifact Record □ Photograph DPR 523A (1/95)	ı kecora 🛚 Otner (List):		*Required informat

Primary # State of California — The Resources Agency **DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION** HRI# BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD Page of *NRHP Status Code *Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder)

B1. Historic Name: B2. Common Name: B4. Present Use: B3. Original Use: *B5. Architectural Style: *B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations) A complete analysis and accounting of any and all alterations or modifications to the building, including re-roofing, re-stuccoing, replacement of siding, replacement of windows, additions, removals, etc. In addition to a field inspection, all available building records, including the residential building record, any and all building permit records, and all available Notices of Completion should be used in this analysis. *B7. Moved? □No □Yes □Unknown **Original Location:** Date: *B8. Related Features: b. Builder: B9a. Architect: *B10. Significance: Theme: Area: Period of Significance: **Property Type: Applicable Criteria:** (Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Also address integrity.) Provide an analysis of the property under all established Historical Resources Board Criteria under criterion headings. The applicant should make a clear and compelling argument as to why the property is or is not significant and eligible for designation under each criterion. (Please refer to the "Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Criteria for Designation" for assistance in applying the criteria). If more space is required, use a DPR 523(L) form, also known as a Continuation Sheet. Use as many Continuation Sheets as necessary. It should be noted that analysis under State and National Criteria is not required unless the applicant is pursuing designation under HRB Criterion E or unless the report is being prepared in response to a request from the Development Services Department. The integrity of the resource should be included in the discussion of the property's eligibility under HRB criteria. The resource must retain integrity in order to be eligible for designation under any and all HRB criteria. The discussion of integrity should be tied to the property type and its contributing character defining features. Not all aspects of integrity are equally significant for all properties. For example, the integrity aspects of setting and location may not be as important for properties significant under HRB Criteria C and D, whereas setting and location can be highly important for properties significant under HRB Criteria A and B. Design materials and workmanship can be more important under HRB Criteria C and D than under HRB Criteria A and B. Feeling and association can be important under all HRB Criteria. Mathematical calculations for integrity analysis are not acceptable. B11. Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) *B12. References: (Sketch Map with north arrow required.) B13. Remarks: Provide a map identifying the block and parcel with cross streets; or a sketch of the archaeology site, cultural landscape, or traditional cultural property. *B14. Evaluator: *Date of Evaluation:

(This space reserved for official comments.)

State of California — The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION	Primary #		
CONTINUATION SHEET	HRI#		
Page of *Resource Name or # (Assign	Trinomial		
rage of Resource Name of # (Assign	ned by recorder)		
*Recorded by:	*Date:	□ Continuation	☐ Update
USE CONTINUATION SHEETS FOR ALL INFORMATION W	THICH CANINOT RECON	TA INIED WITHIN THI	E DDOVIDED
	IE DPR FORM.	NIAINED WIIIIN IIII	ETROVIDED

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required information